CONFLICT IN CITIES AND THE CONTESTED STATE

Everyday life and the possibilities for transformation in Belfast, Jerusalem and other divided cities

www.conflictincities.org



CONFLICT IN CITIES & THE CONTESTED STATE

ANNUAL PROJECT WORKSHOP

16th – 18th September 2009 University of Exeter









WORKSHOP PROGRAMME

Tuesday 15th September

Arrivals: Cambridge and Belfast Teams

3.00 – 5.00 pm: Exeter 'Old City' tour

7.30 pm: Dinner: Strada, Princesshay, Exeter

Wednesday 16th September: Graduate Workshop, Reed Hall, Small room

8.45 – 9.00 am: Tea, coffee & introductions

9.00 – 10.00 am: **Session 1**

Kirkuk/Mostar - Education/divisions

10.00 – 11.00 am **Session 2**

Berlin/Nicosia – Memory and Identity

11.00 – 11.30 am *Tea, coffee*

11.30 am - 1.00 pm **Session 3**

Beirut/Tripoli/Brussels - Space and Bureaucracy

1.00 – 2.00 pm *Lunch*

2.00 – 3.00 pm **Session 4**

Comparativity and Complimentarity:

Discussion on the works of Bollens, Hepburn and Varshney

3.00 – 3.30 pm *Tea, coffee*

3.30 – 4.15 pm **Session 5**

Research Ethics (CL/MD)

Interviews: UK DDU and confidentiality

4.15 – 5.00 pm **Session 6**

Demographic Statistics and the Atlas (JA)

7.30 pm Dinner at Ask, Cathedral Close, Exeter

Thursday 17th September: Project workshop 1, Reed Hall, small room

9.00 – 9.30 am *Tea/coffee*

9.30 – 11.00 am **Session 1**

- a) Introduction: State of Play of Project (MD/WP)
- b) Conference Theme 'Everyday life' (JA)
- Towards a Distinctive CinC approach to Divided Cities: Interrogating the work of Bollens, Calame, Hepburn and Varshney

11.00 - 11.30 am Break

11.30 am - 1.00 pm **Session 2**

- a) Visual Methodology Sourcing Visual Material (LK 30)
- b) 'Tracing lines' Mapping Contested Cities (S.McMullan15)
- c) Divided Cities on Film (45)

1.00 – 2.00 pm *Lunch*

2.00 – 3.30 pm **Session 3** *Jerusalem*

- a) Craig Larkin: The Islamic movement of Israel and the battle for Al- Aqsa (25)
- b) Max Gwiazda: The Problem of the Holy Basin (25)
- c) Lefkos Kyriacou: Reconciling ideological urban visions with everyday city spaces: Contradictions in the work of Charles Ashbee (25)

Chair: WP/ Discussion

3.30 – 4.00 pm *Tea, coffee*

4.00 – 5.30 pm **Session 4** Belfast

- a) Ian Shuttleworth: Spaces of Fear: Communal violence and everyday life in Belfast
- b) Lisa Smyth and Martina McKnight: *The Everyday Dynamics of Belfast's 'Neutral' City Centre: Maternal Perspectives*

Discussion / *Madeleine's paper

7.30 pm Dinner at Al-Farid, Cathedral Yard, Exeter

Friday 18th September: Project workshop 2, Open Day, Institute of Arab & Islamic Studies, Theatre & Dining Area

8.45 – 9.00 am *Tea/Coffee*

9.00 – 11.00 am **Session 1**

- a) Liam O'Dowd/ James Anderson: *Understanding 'Divided Cities' in 'Contested States': Empire, nation and urban space* (30)
- b) Eyal Weizman: tbc
- c) Martin Coward: *Urbicide and the disavowal of Agonism*(30)

Chair - Discussion

11.00 – 11.30 am *Tea, coffee*

11.30 am - 1.30 pm **Session 2**

- a) Mick Dumper: Management of Security for the holy sites in Jerusalem
- b) Oliver Creighton: The Archaeology of Contested Townscapes: Encountering the Heritage of City Walls
- c) Michael Safier: Positioning Planning in Divided Cities: Reflections and Responses

Chair - Discussion

1.30 – 2.30 pm *Buffet lunch*

2.30 – 3.45 pm **Session 3**

- a) Wendy Pullan: Resistance as an Urban Phenomenon in Palestinian Jerusalem
- b) Yael Navaro-Yashin: tbc

Chair - Discussion

3.45 – 4.15 pm *Tea, coffee*

4.15 – 5.30 pm **Session 4**

Roundtable: The Uses and Abuses of Walls

Chair: Mick Dumper Panel: Nick Vaughan-Williams (Exeter), Oliver Creighton (Exeter), Yael Navaro-Yashin (Cambridge),

Madeline Leonard (Belfast)

7.30 pm Dinner at Hour Glass, Melbourne Street, Exeter

SPEAKERS AND ABSTRACTS

Craig Larkin is a research fellow at the Politics Department of Exeter University, working on an ESRC funded project 'Conflict in Cities and the Contested State'. He received his PhD in Middle East Studies from the Institute of Arab and Islamic Studies, Exeter University in April 2009. His research interests include: the politics of memory and identity; urban and social division and conflict; processes of reconciliation and forgiveness [c.larkin@ex.ac.uk].

The Islamic movement of Israel and the battle for Al-Aqsa

This paper examines the growing involvement of the Islamic Movement (IM) of Israel in Jerusalem, both in terms of rhetorical discourse and specific facts on the ground. It explores how the 'Al Aqsa' mosque has been employed, particularly by Sheikh Ra'ad Salah (Northern Branch) as a symbol for political empowerment; a site for public contestation (Waqf authority and IAA digs) and a focus for religious renewal (local piety, activism and tourism). Yet how significant and far reaching is the Islamic movement's impact within Jerusalem and amongst the local Palestinian inhabitants? Should their presence be perceived as a growing 'strategic threat' (Israeli 2008, Seener 2008), part of an 'Islamizing' trend (Klein, 2008) or rather a consequence and culmination of weak local leadership, political intransigence, the failure of secular authority and the unintended consequences of the separation Wall and the non-recognition of the Hamas government.

Maximilian Gwiazda is employed as a researcher on the 'Conflict in Cities' project in the Department of Architecture at Cambridge University. He completed his PhD in the History and Philosophy of Architecture at Cambridge in 2007 and is an academic associate of Pembroke College [mjg75@cam.ac.uk].

The problem of the Holy Basin

This paper analyses the idea of the 'Holy Basin' in Jerusalem from a critical historical and urban perspective. The 'holy basin' (variously referred to as the 'historic' or 'visual' basin) is a geographic zone surrounding the historic Old City situated in East Jerusalem. This zone contains the majority of sites holy to Islam, Judaism and Christianity in the city, and is considered by some to possess a special visual, aesthetic relationship with the walled city integral to Jerusalem's rich religious and heritage value. The concept of the Holy Basin has featured prominently in Israeli contributions to recent peace negotiations and initiatives, many of which have called for some form or special regime for the Holy Basin (sometimes with a degree of internationalisation) to be instated as part of future agreements on Jerusalem as a divided or shared capital within the framework of a two-state solution. The idea is also increasingly common among western, international peace initiatives. Palestinian negotiators have so far remained sceptical about Israeli proposals relating to the Holy Basin. Despite the pervasive use of the Holy Basin idea in the Israeli and western discourse surrounding the city, particularly in relation to alternative governance, legal and security framework there is a general lack of clarity about where the idea of the Holy Basin originated, on what grounds a 'special zone' within Jerusalem is deemed necessary, where its precise boundaries lie and what the urban or landscape character of this zone should be. Most significantly the implications for the everyday life of

Jerusalem with respect to both its relevance for any political agreement and the overall well-being of the city is rarely addressed in any depth. This paper is work in progress and the presentation will focus on introducing the uncertainties and ambiguities regarding the Holy Basin, and begin to unpack its historical development, pointing to the underlying urban issues we are concerned with.

Lefkos Kyriacou qualified as an architect in 2005 and currently lives in London where he works at Cottrell and Vermeulen Architecture. His primary role within the Conflict in cities involves the project's visual research. He is currently looking at the methodology of using drawings for studying divided cities and is also researching connections between urban planning and conservation with historic and contemporary representations of Jerusalem. Lefkos is Director of Studies for Architecture at Fitzwilliam College, Cambridge; he holds an MA and Diploma in Architecture from the University of Cambridge and is registered as an architect with the ARB [lgk20@cam.ac.uk].

Reconciling ideological urban visions with everyday city spaces: Contradictions in the work of Charles Ashbee

Given the enduring legacy of British planning perspectives on Jerusalem and the current controversy surrounding the proposed national parks around the Old City, it seems a good time to revisit some of the ideas that came out of the British Pro-Jerusalem Society that developed this thinking in the early years of the Mandate period. The paper will focus on Charles Ashbee, an architect who was part of the 'Arts and Crafts' movement and a key member of the Society. Whilst Ashbee clearly held romantic and Orientalist views regarding the landscape of Jerusalem that gave him a natural affinity with the Society's outlook, his detailed proposals for the city did attempt to accommodate local, everyday structures; an example of which was the proposed Valero Khan outside Damascus Gate that was never realised. An analysis of Ashbee's work shows that there were contradictions evident in his thinking: between accomodating day-to-day life in Jerusalem and the more familiar idealized visions of the city held by the Pro-Jerusalem Society. More significantly it also suggests alternative approaches to the planning of Jerusalem that could be applicable once again.

Ian Shuttleworth is a Senior Lecturer in the School of Geography, Archaeology and Paleoecology, QUB. The majority of his work has been focussed on residential segregation, spatial mobility, and census analysis in Northern Ireland. Other current research he is undertaking seeks to explore the relationship between internal migration and residential segregation in Northern Ireland [i.shuttleworth@qub.ac.uk].

Spaces of Fear: Communal violence and everyday life in Belfast

Lisa Smyth is a lecturer in Sociology at Queen's University Belfast. Her research interests cover gender, reproduction and national/cultural identities. Her book Abortion & Nation: the Politics of Reproduction in Contemporary Ireland, was published by Ashgate in 2005, and examines the shifting dynamics of abortion politics in the Republic of Ireland since the early 1980s. She has also published work on the cultural politics of sex education and abortion debates in Northern Ireland, as well as on pro-breastfeeding campaigns .She is currently working alongside Martina McKnight on the topic of everyday life for mothers in post-conflict Belfast, as part the ESRC-funded project on Conflict in Cities and the Contested State[l.smyth@qub.ac.uk].

Martina McKnight completed her PhD at Queen's University Belfast in 2007. Using Queen's as a case study, the thesis focused on gender relations and identities within the context of changing academic and social cultures. During and following the completion of the thesis she taught in the School of Sociology, Social Policy and Social Work in Queen's and as an adult literacy tutor in community settings. Since September 2008, she has been working with Lisa Smyth as a research assistant at Queen's on the ESRC funded project Conflict in Cities and the Contested State, exploring aspects of gender and public space in Belfast. [martina.mcknight@qub.ac.uk]

The Everyday Dynamics of Belfast's 'Neutral' City Centre: Maternal Perspectives

This presentation considers the extent to which Belfast's city centre offers a neutral everyday arena where ethno-national divisions can be left behind. Drawing on qualitative research with mothers of young children living in the inner city, the paper asks whether the city centre might offer any possibilities for the development of significant social change or transformation, namely reducing the significance of ethno-nationality in the city. Bourdieu's theorisation of social change is employed to consider the extent to which the post-conflict changes affecting the city centre, including the changes in security and the re-development of buildings and commercial activity, might also produce changes in the everyday dispositions of those who live close by, in territorially divided working class neighbourhoods, historically situated at the heart of the conflict. Mothers are the focus of attention as key actors, both in the reproduction of collective identities over time, and in transgressing social norms in caring for and seeking improvements in their children's lives.

The study found that the city centre has only a marginal significance in the everyday lives of most of the inner-city, working class mothers involved in the study. It is perceived as a neutral place, but is used largely instrumentally, with mothers describing being at ease in the city centre, in ethno-national terms, particularly during the day, but also to some extent at night. Perceptions and use of the city centre reflect degrees of ethno-national indifference, although these can shift in response to particular events or practices that carry symbolic and material ethno-national connotations (e.g. St. Patrick's Day, Orangefest, football matches, young people's activity etc.). However, it is an arena where other divisions, particularly class, motherhood, race, gender and age, come to the fore. Ethno-national dispositions are more in play in inner city residential neighbourhoods, which form the core of our

participants' sense of everyday ease, key to the generation of social stability and social change.

Madeleine Leonard is a Professor of Sociology at the School of Sociology, Social Policy & Social Work in the University of Queen's Belfast. Her interests include the sociology of childhood and children's experiences of growing up in divided societies (Belfast and Nicosia)[M.Leonard@qub.ac.uk].

Abstract: tbc

Liam O'Dowd is Professor of Sociology and Director of the Centre for International Borders Research at Queen's University Belfast. Apart from his role as coinvestigator on the Cities in Conflict project, his current research interests include borders, ethno-national conflict, historical sociology and civil society. He has published extensively on the sociology of borders, the role of intellectuals, and the Northern Ireland conflict [l.odowd@qub.ac.uk].

James Anderson is Emeritus Professor in the School of Geography, Archaeology and Paleoecology, QUB. Before this he was Professor of Political Geography in the University of Newcastle. He has also recently held visiting fellowships in CRASSH (University of Cambridge) and the Institute of Politics and Governance (QUB). His other main research interests, besides his current work on divided cities, are in political territoriality and state borders [J.Anderson@qub.ac.uk]

<u>Understanding 'Divided Cities' in 'Contested States': Empire, nation and urban space</u>

The paper outlines work in progress on developing a historically informed, comparative approach to understanding 'divided cities' in 'contested states'. The analysis of the formative processes which shape, but do not fully determine, ethnonationally divided cities will draw mainly on the experience of Belfast, Jerusalem, and other cities associated with the Conflict in Cities project – Brussels, Nicosia, Mostar, Beirut, Tripoli and Kirkuk. The key questions addressed are: (a) how have these cities have shaped, and been shaped by ethno-national conflicts? and (b) how might they contribute to conflict reduction or resolution? The paper suggests a distinctive approach which locates these cities at the shifting intersections of empire, nation and urban space. Two underlying trends are identified which pull in opposite directions. On the one hand, these cities have the potential to intensify ethno-national conflict because of increased urbanization and their enhanced symbolic importance to protagonists. On the other hand, urban conditions and functional needs produce greater opportunities and pressures to co-operate across ethno-national divides.

Eyal Weizman is an architect, writer and curator based in London. Previously a professor of architecture at the Academy of Fine Arts in Vienna, he is now the director of Goldsmiths College's Centre of Research Architecture. His is author of A Civilian Occupation (Verso, London, 2003) and three co-edited catalogues for the exhibition Territories (May 2003, November 2003, May 2004)[eyal@eruv.net].

Abstract: tbc

Martin Coward is lecturer in International Politics at the University of Newcastle, UK. He is author of Urbicide: The Politics of Urban Destruction (Routledge, 2008). His current research focuses on the contemporary relationship between the city and war. [info@martincoward.net]

Urbicide and the disavowal of agonism

This paper outlines the central dynamics of urbicidal violence. In particular it will examine the manner in which deliberate and widespread destruction of urban environments divides cities into enclaves. This dynamic should be conceived as a disavowal of agonism in favour of antagonism. This dynamic thus represents a disavowal of the fundamental heterogeneity of existence in built environments. This disavowal is primarily witnessed in ethnic-nationalist political violence where motifs of the homogeneity of identity feed violence against the city. Ethnic-nationalist violence carves out enclaves in a bid to naturalise the idea that ethic identities have exclusive territorial domains. This logic divides cities and can be witnessed in cases such as the violence against Mostar in the 1992-95 Bosnian war. This logic of destruction is not, however, the exclusive preserve of ethnic-nationalism and can be traced in a number of homogenising violences that similarly disavow the agonistic plurality of the city.

Mick Dumper teaches Middle East Politics at the University of Exeter, UK, and is author of The Future of the Palestinian Refugees (2007) The Politics of Sacred Space: The Old City of Jerusalem and the Middle East Conflict, 1967-2000,(2001) The Politics of Jerusalem Since 1967, (1997)[Mick.Dumper@exeter.ac.uk].

Management of Security for the holy sites in Jerusalem

One of the most important contributions that policy-makers and analysts can make to a negotiated agreement on Jerusalem is to construct a framework for managing the security of the holy sites of the city which is transparent, equitable and effective. This presentation sets out they key challenges to creating such a framework which, in addition to the political difficulties, include issues relating to the location of the sites, their close proximity to each other, the overlapping rituals, the fragmented and often disputed religious administration and the close scrutiny non-local actors. It then presents a "Five Pillar" model, focussing a) on how a holy sites security framework would be constituted and b) how consultation with the religious authorities could be made more effective. Reference to the management of cultural monuments in other conflicted cities will also be considered.

Michael Safier is an economist and planning analyst recently retired from the Development Planning Unit at University College London, having been involved in teaching, training, consultancy and policy research on urban development, and latterly cosmopolitan planning, since 1971. He attended the London School of Economics and the University of Chicago 1959-66. He worked on policy, planning and management issues, training and capacity building in Africa, Asia and the Middle East, including in later years Bosnia, Cyprus, India-Pakistan and Israel-Palestine [ucfumis@ucl.ac.uk].

Positioning Planning in Divided Cities: Reflections and Responses

The paper examines how to assess what 'room for manoeuvre' can be found in different times and places for urban planning, policy and management interventions to advance viable, secure and equitable circumstances in the everyday life of divided cities? The presentation will develop an analytical framework to explore different dimensions of action - and their interrelationships - which might be available to planners - working across a range of professions and institutions at different levels - to promote conflict prevention, reduction and transformation. The framework equally allows for consideration of the multiple limitations on any such initiatives being feasible or sustainable. Evidence will be drawn from both research on and practice of planning in divided cities over the two decades 1989-2009, but also from possibly applicable experiences elsewhere, notably in 'development' planning for poverty reduction in cities of the global south, and 'cosmopolitan' planning for intercultural co-existence in multicultural cities of the global north.

Oliver Creighton is Senior Lecturer in Archaeology at the University of Exeter. He is a landscape archaeologist and medievalist who specialises in the study of medieval castles, towns and elite landscapes. He has a particular research interest in the impact of status and authority on past landscapes [O.H.Creighton@exeter.ac.uk].

The Archaeology of Contested Townscapes: Encountering the Heritage of City Walls

Today, the surviving fabric of urban defences (and the townscapes they define) are features of heritage that hold great potential as cultural resources but in management terms pose substantial challenges, practical and philosophical. Town walls can be conceptualised as a 'dissonant' form of heritage whose value is frequently contested between different interest groups and whose meanings are not static but can be rewritten. All these factors present considerable challenges to those responsible for conserving and researching heritage sites that are simultaneously living communities. Against this background, this discussion paper reviews (from an archaeological viewpoint) some of the practicalities and politics of designating and delineating historic walled communities as heritage sites, and examines some strategies for managing the archaeological resource.

Wendy Pullan is Senior Lecturer in Architecture at the University of Cambridge. She is Principal Investigator for 'Conflict in Cities and the Contested State', a five year multidisciplinary and international research project supported by the Large Grant programme of the Economic and Social Research Council of Great Britain (ESRC). She is a Fellow of Clare College Cambridge [wap10@cam.ac.uk].

Resistance as an Urban Phenomenon in Palestinian Jerusalem

Resistance can be regarded most simply as the undermining of an existing situation of control in order to shift power relations. Power itself is well-established as a concept and its structure and impacts have, especially through the work of Foucault, become standard fare in research. Resistance is very often seen only in relation to power, effectively as 'counter-power', that is, as a lesser or minor power against a major power. As such, it may play a role in contested cities. But is it also possible that resistance can be usefully considered not just as a counter-movement used at an opportune time to provoke change, but as something that in practice might, for better or worse, become

established in the culture(s) of which it is part? To what extent is resistance fundamental to the way a society manages itself, as well as formulative for the process of long term change? This line of thought brings into play the city as an embodiment of polity and a territory of critical density and diversity, where institutions normally exist that have the capacity to absorb and enact change. This paper will consider these questions of urban resistance in the context of Palestinian Jerusalem, a city under occupation since 1967, and today the locus of a number of fragmented efforts that may be understood as urban resistance.

Yael Navaro-Yashin is a Director of Studies and Senior lecturer in Social Anthropology at the University of Cambridge. Her current research addresses the crossing points between conflict resolution, organizational culture, disciplinary knowledge practices, and international law. She is author of Faces of the State: Secularism and Public Life in Turkey (Princeton University Press, 2002) [yn213@cam.ac.uk].

Abstract: tbc